Bridge Abutment Scour in Compound River Channels

S. Kouchakzadeh\(^1\) and R.D. Townsend\(^2\)

**ABSTRACT**

Most previous laboratory studies of local scour at bridge abutments were performed in rectangular channels in which the distributions of flow velocity and bed shear stress were considered uniform in the transverse direction. In reality however, bridge abutments are usually located in the floodplain zone of rivers where velocity and shear stress distributions are directly affected by the lateral momentum transfer. The influence of channel geometry and lateral momentum transfer in compound flow field on scouring phenomenon, however, has not been fully investigated and understood as yet. This paper presents the results of an experimental study performed to investigate the impact of both sediment size and lateral momentum transfer on local scour at abutments terminating in the floodplain of a compound channel. It is shown that, by accounting for lateral momentum transfer at small floodplain/main channel depth ratios \((y_f/H<0.3)\), estimates of maximum local scour depth are increased by up to 30\%. In relation to the sediment size, earlier studies of scouring around circular bridge piers proposed a limit for the relative size of sediment (pier diameter/median size of bed material) beyond which the sediment size has no effect on the equilibrium scour depth (Ettema, 1980; Chiew, 1984). The results of the current laboratory studies, however, indicated that the limit established for circular bridge piers might not be appropriate for the abutment case installed in the floodplain zones; further studies are required to draw a more general conclusion regarding the effects of relative grain size in the abutment case.

**Keywords:** Scouring, Floodplain, Momentum transfer, Compound channel, Bridge, Abutment, Pier

**INTRODUCTION**

In spite of improved construction methods and materials and advanced techniques of analysis and design, the list of the failed bridges due to excessive scour around piers and abutments continues to lengthen. Some bridge failure records indicate that about 60\% of failures can be attributed to scour and other related hydraulic conditions (Shirole and Holt, 1991). Although some 35 formulae have been proposed for predicting maximum local scour at bridge piers (Copp *et al.*, 1988), only a few equations have been proposed for the case of bridge abutments. Moreover, most equations for predicting abutment scour are based on laboratory data compiled for model abutments installed in rectangular flumes (Ahmad, 1953; Garde *et al.*, 1961; Gill, 1972; Rajaratnam and Nwachukwu, 1983; Kwan, 1993).
While this arrangement is appropriate for the case of bridge abutments projecting into a river's Main Channel (MC), it is generally inappropriate when abutments terminate in the Flood Plain (FP) where significant variations in both velocity distribution and boundary roughness can be expected.

Local Scour Classification

Introducing a bridge abutment, or any other kind of flow obstructing structure into a watercourse, dramatically changes the flow pattern of the stream in the vicinity of the structure. Highly three-dimensional and rotational in nature, the generated flow structure locally increases the bed shear stress to a value higher than the critical one and initiates the scour process. The temporal development of the scour hole can be expressed as:

\[
\frac{dV}{dt} = (Q_s)_o - (Q_s)_j
\]

in which \( V \) = volume of scour hole, \( t \) = time, and \( (Q_s)_o \) and \( (Q_s)_j \) are respectively the volumetric rate of sediment going out of and coming into the scour hole.

According to the conditions of bed material movement, the local scour process is generally classified as clear-water scour or live-bed scour (Lautersen, 1952; Raudkivi and Sutherland, 1981). When the approach flow velocity of a stream does not exceed a critical value, above which bed particles move, no general bed material movement is observed. In such flow conditions \( (Q_s)_j = 0 \) and no bed material enters the scour hole, therefore, the local scour process is classified as clear-water scour.

Live-bed scour, however, occurs in streams having general bed movement. In this case, the bed shear stress is higher than the critical value at every point of the streambed. Therefore, the removed particles from the scour hole are replenished by the moving bed materials, i.e. \( (Q_s)_o > (Q_s)_j > 0 \). Since no such replacement for the removed material takes place in a clear-water condition, the scour hole is generally deeper in clear-water conditions than in live-bed conditions. Accordingly, the clear-water scour depth is recommended for design purposes (Melville, 1992; Melville and Sutherland, 1988).

Effects of Channel Geometry

Watercourse cross-sectional geometry has long been recognized as an important parameter that governs the pattern of velocity distribution, boundary shear stress, momentum transfer, and secondary circulations in open channel flows (Townsend, 1968; Myers, 1991). Because of the high resistance coefficients associated with the flood plain zones of rivers, flows in the FP are generally much slower than those in the main channel. At small FP depths, the difference between MC and FP velocities initiates a strong Lateral Momentum Transfer (LMT) in the form of banks of vortices having their vertical axes along the MC/FP junction regions (Figure 1). These vortices act as a mechanism for transferring momentum between the MC and FP zones by their continuous emergence and decay (Sellin, 1964). As a consequence of LMT, the MC flow velocity and discharge decrease immediately above the bankfull depth, while the corresponding FP values increase.

Figure 1. Banks of vortices at the MC/FP junctions.
impact of LMT on both the value and distribution of boundary shear stress in the MC and FP of an asymmetric compound-shaped channel. They compared observed boundary shear stress distributions obtained under interacting (i.e. combined MC/FP flow) conditions with those for non-interacting (isolated FP flow) conditions. For their shallowest FP depth, they observed 260% and 200% increases respectively in maximum and average FP shear stresses (Figure 2). Also, in other studies by Myers (1977) it was indicated that the apparent shear force acting on the vertical plane of MC/FP junction amounts to 25% of the weight component of the MC and 200% of that of the FP. Clearly, in severely compound flow fields, LMT significantly impacts both the value and distribution of boundary shear stress. Therefore, to improve the understanding of the mechanism of local scour in FP zones it is necessary to properly account for LMT in these situations. This may hopefully lead to a more realistic estimation of maximum scour in such circumstances.

While extensive literature has been published on the subject of local scour at bridge piers and to a lesser extent at bridge abutments, since most of these studies were performed in rectangular-shaped laboratory channels, none address the issue of LMT and its impact on the local scouring process. Melville and Parola (1995) categorized the abutment scour into three cases (Figure 3) and point to the need for further research to investigate the impact of channel shape and sediment size and gradation effects on the local scouring process at abutments located in compound river channels. By considering an imaginary boundary at the MC/FP junction, Melville (1995) regarded the scouring process at abutments terminating in the FP of a compound channel (case III(a), Figure 3) as being similar to that at abutments located...
in a simple rectangular channel (case I, Figure 3). However, he stressed on the need for further investigations for such cases by stating that "the concept of using an imaginary flow boundary for case III(a) needs to be checked experimentally".

**Effect of Relative Size of Sediment**

The effects of sediment characteristics on the equilibrium scour depth, \(Y_{se}\), has been the subject of studies by, among others, Shen et al. (1966), Ettema (1980), and Chiew (1984). Considering other researchers' piers data in addition to their own data, Shen et al. (1966) came to the conclusion that the maximum scour depth is independent of sediment size when \(D_{50}<0.52\) mm.

The effects of sediment size and gradation on the maximum scour depth at bridge piers installed in rectangular channels were studied by Ettema (1980). Based on laboratory data compiled for clear water conditions (no general bed material movement), different pier sizes, \(b\), and sediment sizes in the range \(0.24<D_{50}<7.8\) mm, Ettema established a graphical relationship between the relative size of the pier, \(b/D_{50}\), and the relative equilibrium scour depth \(Y_{se}/b\). With non-ripple-forming sediment his collected data indicate that sediment size has no influence on \(Y_{se}/b\) as long as \(b/D_{50}>25\).

Chiew (1984) extended Ettema's work to observe the effects of pier and sediment sizes on the equilibrium scour depth under live-bed conditions (general downstream movement of bed material exists). Using the same parameters as Ettema's, Chiew showed that for live-bed conditions the relationship between \(Y_{se}\) (average equilibrium scour depth) and \(b/D_{50}\) follows the same trend as it does for the clear-water condition. Therefore he concluded that for the bridge pier case, in both clear-water and live-bed conditions, \(Y_{se}/b\) might be considered independent of sediment size as long as the relative pier size \(b/D_{50}>50\).

In the abutment case, since \(L/D_{50}<50\) is unlikely to be encountered in both laboratory and field conditions on the one hand, and on the other there is a lack of data to evaluate the effects of the relative sediment size, engineers usually rely on Ettema's (bridge pier) results when considering abutments (Melville, 1992).

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

The experimental program was performed in a 12.20 m-long \times 1.20 m-wide compound channel located in the Hydraulics Laboratory of the Civil Engineering Department, University of Ottawa. The channel cross-section comprises a trapezoidal-shaped MC (bottom width=0.30 m; side slope=0.5 H:1V) located between two rectangular-shaped FPs (each 0.38 m wide), Figure 4a. The longitudinal slope of the channel is fully adjustable. The 2.43 m-long test section had a specially-designed (recessed) FP compartment to accommodate the model abutments and a sand test bed. The remaining FP sections of the channel were artificially roughened with wire mesh, using wire diameter of 0.5 mm built into 3.17 mm square-patterned openings.

The interaction phenomenon had been studied by isolating the MC flow from that of the FP by many researchers (Myers and Elsawy, 1975; Myers, 1977, Rajaratnam and Ahmadi, 1979). The same method was adopted here, i.e. the non-interacting conditions were established by isolating the MC flow from that of the FP by means of a 0.5 mm thick metal sheet 0.202 m wide and 2.438 m long, which was formed in an L-shape and installed over the test section junction line separating the MC and the left FP zone (Figure 4b). Figure 4c shows a perspective view of the test section.
Since all experiments were to be run at or close to the threshold condition of bed material movement, the ratio $u_s/u_{fc}=1.00$, where $u_s$=local shear velocity and $u_{fc}$=critical shear velocity (associated with $D_{50}$ size). Shields diagram (see Vanoni, 1975) is the criterion for developing the necessary threshold relationship between the representative grain size ($D_{50}$), the sediment Reynolds Number ($Re_s$) and the dimensionless shear stress parameter.
The relationship takes the form:

\[
D_s = \left( \frac{(R_e v)\rho}{\tau_s (\gamma_s - \gamma)} \right)^{1/3}
\]

where \( D_s \) = uniform grain size, \( v \) = fluid kinematic viscosity, \( \rho \) = fluid density, \( \gamma_s \) and \( \gamma \) = specific weight of sediment particle and fluid, respectively.

From Shields analysis, the critical shear stress (\( \tau_c \)) associated with the selected \( D_{50} \) may be expressed as:

\[
\tau_c = \tau_s (\gamma_s - \gamma) D_{50}
\]

Based on Equations 2 and 3, a computer program was written to calculate the \( D_{50} \) size required to satisfy the threshold condition for a specific flow depth \( y_s \) and bed slope \( S_o \). Sample relationships obtained in this manner for 3 different levels of \( S_o \) and for a near-threshold condition (i.e. \( u_u/u'_c = 0.95 \)), are presented in Figure 5. Once the hydraulic boundary conditions for a particular set of experiments are specified, this program facilitates selection of the appropriate \( D_{50} \) size. Following this procedure, two different grades of sand whose characteristics are summarized in Table 1 were selected for the experimental program. Since the geometric standard deviations, \( \sigma_g \) of both sand samples are smaller than 1.5, the samples are classified as uniformly graded sand.

![Figure 5. \( y_sS_oD_{50} \) relationship for establishing near-threshold condition](image)

Abutments with overall lengths of 90, 150, and 210 mm and of four different shapes: namely, (i) Vertical-Wall (VW), (ii) Semi-Circular (SC), (iii) Wing-Wall (WW), and (iv) Spill-Through (ST) were investigated (Figure 6). The models were constructed from solid plexiglass blocks and a side slope of 1(H):1.175(V) was adopted for the WW-and ST-abutments.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>sand</th>
<th>( D_{84} ) (mm)</th>
<th>( D_{50} ) (mm)</th>
<th>( D_{16} ) (mm)</th>
<th>( \sigma_g )</th>
<th>angle of repose</th>
<th>( \rho_s/P )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.794</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.586</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>2.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.530</td>
<td>0.500</td>
<td>0.416</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>2.65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A mini-propeller meter, capable of detecting mean velocities as low as 0.025 m/s with a maximum error of ±1.5%, was employed for measuring velocity distributions. Measurements were recorded using a data acquisition system specifically designed for the purpose. Water surface profiles along the channel were monitored via twelve manometers connected to tapping points located along the MC. To achieve near-uniform flow conditions, the flume tailgate was adjusted until the water surface slope closely matched the preset channel bed slope. A duration of 5 hrs was selected for the tests. Long-period tests (140 hr duration) indicated that scour depths at 5 hr were approximately 60% of the equilibrium scour depth, \( y_{se} \) for the \( D_{50}=0.5 \) mm sand and 65% for the \( D_{50}=0.7 \) mm one.

### RESULTS

#### Shear Velocity Ratios

Local shear velocity ratios, \( u_u/u'_c \) (\( u_u \) and \( u'_c \) = local and critical shear velocities, respectively) at the end of the 90 mm-, 150 mm-, and 210 mm-long model abutments were
determined based on comparisons between observed (vertical) velocity profiles and the theoretical (log-law) distributions. Figure 7 shows a sample comparison for non-interacting flow conditions for $D_{50}=0.5$ mm and $y_d/H=0.24$ ($y_a$ and $H$ = FP and total flow depths, respectively). The shear velocity ratios for non-interacting flow conditions are presented in Figure 8. The figure shows that $u_d/u_c$ increases as the MC/FP junction is approached.

**Effect of LMT on Scour Depth**

To examine the effects of isolating the FP flow component from the MC flow on the local scouring process, the data for interacting conditions are compared with those for non-interacting ones. The data for different abutment shapes and $y_d/H=0.21$ and 0.24 indicate that non-interacting conditions produce 15 to 30% smaller $y_d/y_a$ than that for interacting conditions.
Isolating the MC flow from the FP flow eliminates LMT and decreases flow velocity in the region close to the MC/FP junction. This in turn decreases the shear velocity ratio in the FP. Assuming a linear relationship between $y_{se}$ and $u_{se}/u_{w}$ in the range $0.5 < u_{se}/u_{w} < 1$, the data were such modified as to account for the fact $u_{se}/u_{w} < 1$. The modified $y_{se}/y_{a}$ for non-interacting conditions still show 5 to 15% smaller values than for interacting conditions. The differences between $y_{se}/y_{a}$ for interacting and non-interacting conditions were between 10 to 35% for $D_{50}=0.7$ mm and $y_{a}/H=0.27$. The non-interacting data for $D_{50}=0.7$ mm, after being modified for the shear velocity ratio, are still smaller than the interacting data. Isolating the FP flow from that of the MC affected the 90 mm-abutments the most.

The data for VW-, ST-, WW-, and SC-abutment shapes are presented in Figs. 9.a to 9.d respectively. The variations in $y_{se}/y_{a}$ follow similar trends for all abutment shapes. Non-interacting conditions, however, decreased the scour depth at VW-abutments the most (Figure 9.a). Also, the figures show that the relative decrease in $y_{se}/y_{a}$ for non-interacting conditions is higher at shorter abutments than at longer ones. For instance, the decrease in $y_{se}/y_{a}$ at 90 mm-SC abutments due to non-interacting conditions amounted to 30% while for 210 mm-SC abutments 15% decrease in $y_{se}/y_{a}$ was observed.

A comparison of the interacting and non-interacting data reveals that isolating the MC flow from the FP flow reduces scour depth. Under non-interacting conditions the 210 mm-abutments obstruct 55% of the FP width. In such a case one would expect to observe an increase in the scour depth, because of the scour component that would normally occur as a result of the relatively high degree of flow contraction. Yet, the resulting scour depths are substantially smaller for non-interacting conditions than for interacting conditions for the 210 mm-abutments. Because flows in the FP are generally slower than those in the main channel, one would expect smaller...
scour depths in the FP zones. However, the presence of a strong LMT at small FP depths increases the scour depth in the FP zones.

Relative Size of Sediment

The sediment size and gradation are substantial factors in accurately estimating the magnitude of the scour depth at abutments. A comparison between the $D_{50}=0.7$ mm and $D_{50}=0.5$ mm results is possible if the data are non-dimensionalized by a length scale. The effect of sediment size can be examined if scour depth and sediment size are non-dimensionalized by abutment length, $L$. The non-dimensionalized data for interacting conditions are presented in Figure 10. This figure shows the variations of $y_{sc}/L$ with $L/D_{50}$ for different abutment shapes and sediment sizes. Figure 10a shows the results for SC-abutments of $L=90$, 150, and 210 mm, for both $D_{50}=0.5$ and 0.7 mm. The data indicate that, for a given abutment length, decreasing $D_{50}$ decreases $y_{sc}/L$. The rate of reduction in the scour depth, however, decreases with an increase in $L$. Figure 10 suggests that there should be a peak of relative scour depth for $L/D_{50} > 50$. The conclusion is valid for the applied sediment sizes and further investigations are required to draw a more general conclusion regarding the maximum relative scour depth and the range beyond which the relative sediment size has no influence on the relative scour depth for the abutment case. The results of the current study are in concordance with Ettema's (1980) data for $D_{50} < 0.7$ mm. Although Ettema concluded that no general
Most of the earlier experimental studies of abutment scour were performed in channels of rectangular cross-section. While this approach is appropriate for abutments located in a river's MC, it is inappropriate for abutments terminating in the FP zones, particularly if LMT effects are strong. Although slower flows in the FP zones should result in shallower scour depths, the LMT tends to increase the scour depth in those regions. Our study data indicate that, for the case of abutments terminating in the FP regions, under conditions of strong flow interaction, LMT effects can produce a 15-30% increase in local scour depth. Therefore, design relationships for predicting maximum scour depth should account for LMT in these instances.

Comparison of the results obtained using two sediment sizes indicates that, for the case of abutments, $D_{50}$ affects scour depth even when $L/D_{50} > 50$. Accordingly, the limit set by Ettema for circular bridge piers might not be appropriate for the abutment case. Further studies, however, are required to draw a more general conclusion regarding the effects of sediment size for the case of bridge abutments.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Most of the earlier experimental studies of abutment scour were performed in channels of rectangular cross-section. While this approach is appropriate for abutments located in a river's MC, it is inappropriate for abutments terminating in the FP zones, particularly if LMT effects are strong. Although slower flows in the FP zones should result in shallower scour depths, the LMT tends to increase the scour depth in those regions. Our study data indicate that, for the case of abutments terminating in the FP regions, under conditions of strong flow interaction, LMT effects can produce a 15-30% increase in local scour depth. Therefore, design relationships for predicting maximum scour depth should account for LMT in these instances.

Comparison of the results obtained using two sediment sizes indicates that, for the case of abutments, $D_{50}$ affects scour depth even when $L/D_{50} > 50$. Accordingly, the limit set by Ettema for circular bridge piers might not be appropriate for the abutment case. Further studies, however, are required to draw a more general conclusion regarding the effects of sediment size for the case of bridge abutments.

**REFERENCES**


آبستسی یاپایه‌های جنایی پل‌ها در رودخانه‌های با مقطع مربک
چکیده
در گذشته اغلب مطالعات آزمایشگاهی پدیده آبستسی اطراف پایه‌های جنایی پل‌ها در فلز‌های با مقطع مستطیلی ساده صورت گرفته است. یکنواختی توزیع سرعت جریان و تنش برای سید مقطع عرضی از مشخص‌های بارز جریان در این مطالعات بوده است. این گونه مطالعات نمی‌ایجادی سرنوشت پایه‌های جنایی در مجاری اصلی رودخانه‌ها می‌باشد. در حالی که در عمل معمولاً پایه‌های جنایی پل‌ها در ناحیه سیاباد غرافاب رودخانه‌ها قرار می‌گیرند، جایی که انتقال جانی اندام حزیک سرعت جریان و تنش برشی بستر اثر مستقیم دارد. اما هنوز اثر این عامل و تأثیر ناحیه مقطع بر روی پدیده آبستسی در مقطع مربک به طور گروه مورد بررسی قرار نگرفته است. در این تحقیق، مطالعه آزمایشگاهی اثر اندازه نسبی زیر زیر اثرات انتقال جانی اندام حزیک بر نیروی آبستسی اطراف پایه‌های جنایی که در میان‌انداز غرافاب قرار گرفته‌اند، صورت گرفت. عمق آبستسی که تحت تأثیر انتقال جانی اندام حزیک به دست آمده یا عمقی که بدن ان مشاهده شده است، مورد مقایسه قرار گرفته‌اند. در نسبی‌های کوچک اعمای جریان در میان‌انداز غرافاب به کل عمق جریان (0.3) انتقال جانی اندام حزیک شدید می‌باشد. اندام‌های غرافات آبستسی در اطراف پایه‌های جنایی در این حدود از نسبی اعمای جریان، نشان داد که انتقال جانی اندام حزیک می‌تواند در 60% افزایش دهد. این تحقیق نشان می‌دهد که ناهداهه گرفتگی اثر انتقال جانی اندام حزیک در برآورد مهندسی می‌تواند به تناوب نادرستی منجر شود. از اینرو برای برآورد صحیح میزان اکتشافات در چنین موقعیت‌هایی باید به گونه‌ای اثر این عامل اعمال شود. همچنین مطالعات در مورد اثر اندام حزیک نسبی دترمینهت (نسبت قطر پایه به قطر ذرات) بر میزان آبستسی منجر به تعیین حدی برای نسبت فنی شده است که ورای آن حد اندام حزیک ذرات تأثیر قدرت پایه‌های آبستسی دور. این مطالعات عملکرد آبی پایه‌های مناسب با سطح مقطع دایره‌ای صورت گرفته است. به دلیل کمبود اطلاعات در مورد اثر نسبی ذرات برای پایه‌های جنایی، در حال حاضر طراحان از حد وضع شده برای پایه‌های مستندرب میانی استفاده می‌کنند. اما تحقیق انجام شده نشان می‌دهد که کاربرد حد مذکور برای پایه‌های جنایی مناسب نیست، رسیدن به یک نتیجه قطعی مستلزم مطالعات تفصیلی بیشتری می‌باشد.