Mean Intercondylar Notch Width Index in Cases With and Without Anterior Cruciate Ligament Tears

Background/Objective: It has been proposed that a narrow intercondylar notch may increase the risk of anterior cruciate ligament (ACL) injury but the data are conflicting. We performed this cross-sectional study to investigate if a narrow intercondylar notch width is a risk factor for ACL tears.

Patients and Methods: All adult patients with knee problems, who were referred to the MRI department of Poursina Hospital, Rasht, Iran, from October 2006 to October 2007, were included in this study. Axial and longitudinal MRI were performed using a 1-T Phillips machine with the patient’s knee in an extended position. In all patients, the femoral notch and the distal condylar width were measured. Cases with normal ACL were used as control and patients with a complete or incomplete tear of ACL were chosen as case group. Because of the effect of osteoarthritis in decreasing the intercondylar notch index, cases with obvious osteoarthritis were not included in the study. Independent sample Student’s t test was used to compare the means.

Results: 328 patients were enrolled in the study. The age range was 18–72 years. We found no significant difference in the mean notch width index (NWI) in patients with (0.296) and without (0.298) an ACL tear (P > 0.05). In addition, there was no significant difference in the frequency of ACL tears in patients with and without critical notch stenosis (P > 0.05).

Conclusion: We did not find a relationship between narrow intercondylar notch width and ACL tears and we do not recommend a knee MRI to predict the probability of ACL injury.

Keywords: Anterior Cruciate Ligament, Intercondylar Notch, Knee

Introduction

The anterior cruciate ligament (ACL), which is located in the intercondylar notch of the femur, is one of the major stabilizing intracapsular ligaments in the knee joint. ACL is proximally attached to the postero-medial surface of the lateral femoral condyle and distally to the anterior part of the intercondylar eminence of the tibia. Injuries to the knee joint are common in athletes and the ACL is the most frequently ruptured ligament of the knee.1 Unfortunately, ACL injuries can be devastating. Numerous reconstructive procedures have been devised to treat an ACL tear.2 However, there is no ideal substitute for an athlete’s normal ACL. Obviously, finding ways to predict the risk of ACL injury and preventing it is of paramount importance.

It has been suggested that a narrow intercondylar notch may increase the risk of ACL injury.3 To study the role of notch stenosis in ACL tears, use of notch width index (NWI)—the ratio of the width of the intercondylar notch to the width of the distal femur at the level of the popliteal groove—eliminates magnification variability and differences in patient body size and stature.4 Some studies have mentioned that there is a relationship between femoral intercondylar notch stenosis and ACL tears,5–8 while others have not.9–11 If this relationship exists, it could be an important variable to identify athletes at risk for development...
of ACL tears. We performed this cross-sectional study to investigate if a narrow intercondylar notch width is a risk factor for development of ACL tears.

**Patients and Methods**

From October 2006 to October 2007, all adult patients with knee problems (including pain in or around the knee, presence of an audible click and trauma) referred to the MRI department of Poursina Hospital, Rasht, Iran were enrolled in this study. Exclusion criteria were any connective tissue or systemic bone disease, history of knee fracture or knee operation.

Patients were evaluated by a 1-T Philips MR machine while their knees were extended and axial and sagittal images were taken. In all patients, the femoral notch and the distal condylar width were measured. The notch width was the length between the medial projection of the lateral femoral condyle to the lateral projection of the medial condyle. Both transcondylar width and notch width were measured on a line drawn through the popliteal groove, which was parallel to a line drawn across the most distal aspect of both condyles. We used the maximal measures of transcondylar width and notch width were measured on a line drawn through the popliteal groove, which was parallel to a line drawn across the most distal aspect of both condyles. All measurements were reviewed by both authors.

Patients with normal ACLs were used as the control and patients with a complete or incomplete tear of ACL were chosen as the case group. Partial tears of ACL were diagnosed based on the presence of bulging, border irregularities or abnormal signals on T2W sequences of the knee MRI (Fig. 2).

Data were analyzed by SPSS ver 11.01 (SPSS Inc, Chicago, IL, USA). The mean notch size, femoral bi-condylar width, and NWI between injured and non-injured patients were compared by independent sample Student’s t test. The level of significance was set at 0.05.

**Results**

This study included 328 patients. The age range was 18–72 years. There were 146 patients less than 30 years of age; 100 were in the 31 to 40-years age group and 82 were older than 41 years (Table 1).

An ACL tear was found in 148 patients. The mean±SD NWI was 0.298±0.05 and critical notch stenosis (NWI of equal or less than 0.20) was found in 11 patients. Considering critical notch stenosis, no significant difference was found in different age groups (P > 0.05).

We found no significant difference in the mean NWI in patients with and without an ACL tear (Table 2). In addition, there was no significant difference in the frequency of an ACL tear in patients with and without critical notch stenosis (P= 1.0). Considering women and men separately, we found no significant difference in the mean NWI in patients with and without an ACL tear.

**Discussion**

Previous studies have shown an association between femoral notch stenosis and ACL tears. Based on these findings, recommendations such as performing a notch view radiography before participation in athletic activities and counseling athletes with stenotic intercondylar notches have been proposed. Results of our study did not support such association.

Palmer et al. were the first to suggest that a narrow intercondylar notch may increase the risk of ACL injury in 1938. This suggestion was supported by Souryal et al. who developed the concept of NWI as a way to predict the risk of ACL injury in 1998. Using CT, Houseworth et al. concluded that a narrow post-
erior notch may predispose a person to ACL injury;\textsuperscript{13} Anderson et al. reported that anterior outlet notch stenosis increases the risk of ACL injury.\textsuperscript{14} In a two-year prospective study, LaPrade and Burnett concluded that athletes with a stenotic notch were at significant risk of an ACL rupture.\textsuperscript{12} The proposed relationship between the risk of ACL injury and a narrow intercondylar notch was based on the hypothesis that the size of the ACL correlates with the size of the intercondylar notch.\textsuperscript{5}

This hypothesis, however, has been challenged by new data. Muneta et al. found that ligament size was not different in knees with an NWI greater and less than 0.20.\textsuperscript{15} Clinically, Herzog et al. found no significant differences between the notch measurements of athletes with chronic ACL tears and the control group with both radiograph and MRI measurements.\textsuperscript{9} Similarly, Shickendantz and Weiker compared unilateral ACL injury, bilateral ACL injury, and non-injured subjects and found no significant differences between the groups. They concluded that intercondylar notch measurements should not be used to predict the potential for injury to the ACL.\textsuperscript{10} Lombardo et al. also did not find an association between NWI and the rate of ACL injury in professional male basketball players.\textsuperscript{11}

We studied 328 patients with knee problems. Considering the association between NWI and the rate of ACL injury, we did not find any significant differences in the mean NWI or the prevalence of critical notch stenosis in patients with and without an ACL tear, in all patients and in male and female patients, separately. Our results, however, must be interpreted with caution. That was a cross-sectional study and results of a prospective study would be more reliable. We studied subjects with knee problems, which may cause a selection bias. Since there is no report indicating a relationship between NWI and other knee problems except osteoarthritis, we believe that these factors are not critical. Another limitation in our study was that our subjects were not limited to athletes and the presence of other mechanisms of ACL injury, including direct trauma, may ameliorate the role of narrow NWI in ACL injury.

In conclusion, we did not find a relationship between a narrow intercondylar notch width and an ACL tear and therefore, we cannot recommend performing a knee MRI to predict the probability of an ACL injury.
Conflict of interests

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

References